

Stuttgart 21
concerns us all!

Good reasons for Stuttgart 21? There aren't any

Dear Stuttgarters, Rail users, Tax payers,

With Stuttgart 21 set to cost at least 5.3 billion euros* (excluding the new line between Wendlingen and Ulm) at a time when public spending is under considerable pressure, it is clear that this project concerns us all. Given the many conflicting claims made about Stuttgart 21, it is worthwhile taking a close look at the principal arguments put forward by the supporters of the project.

1) "There is no alternative to S21 - it was chosen after 60 different station concepts had been examined"

In fact: All the concepts considered by the project's backers in the 1990s complied with a precondition which required that the track approaches to the current station be freed up for development - something which could only be achieved by putting the station underground. The fact that a modernised aboveground station (Kopfbahnhof 21 - K21) would represent a far less costly and more efficient alternative was never considered. For this reason S21 is not really a rail project. It is first and foremost a real estate project because the main motivation for S21 lies in the development of the former track area.

2) "Without S21, Stuttgart will be disconnected from the rest of Europe"

In fact: A modernised aboveground station (K21) will continue to be served by ICE and TGV trains in exactly the same way as the current station is. Furthermore, the „Magistrale for Europe from Paris to Budapest“ vaunted by the S21 supporters simply does not exist and will not be summoned into existence by S21 (Deutsche Bahn Board Member Dr Kefer admitted as much during the fact check session on 4 November 2010).

3) "The new, underground station will be more efficient than the aboveground station"

In fact: The planned underground station has only eight platforms and a total of four entry and exit tracks. A modernised aboveground station (K21), on the other hand, has 16 platforms and a total of five or six entry and exit tracks. This means that K21 is not only able to bring more trains in and out of the station at any given moment, but also that it can accommodate more trains simultaneously than S21 can. With suitable synchronisation of train services (by means of an ITF* "integrated regular-service timetable", as used successfully in Switzerland) K21 offers passengers a large number of convenient connections and so reduces overall travel times significantly. This applies in particular to connections between regional train services which account for the majority of trains using the main station in Stuttgart.

* According to the Federal Audit Office: 5.3 billion euros. Rail consultants Vieregg & Rössler estimate the cost to be as high as 6.9 billion euros.

** ITF = Integraler Taktfahrplan (integrated regular-service timetable): rail services are provided regularly at set intervals, reliable connections are provided with services in different directions without wasting time through long waiting periods.

4) "S21 cuts travel times significantly and so allows Baden-Württemberg to grow together"

In fact: The reduction in travel time between Ulm and Stuttgart is entirely due to the planned new line between Ulm and Wendlingen; the underground station has no effect. The new line is an independent project which could also be built without Stuttgart 21. Furthermore, Stuttgart 21 is seriously detrimental to regional rail services (for example, there is no emergency plan in the event of disruption to the S-Bahn service).

5) "S21 is an important infrastructure project for the Land of Baden-Württemberg"

In fact: The unnecessary and unwanted underground station, which will cost at least 5.3 billion euros*, will divert funds which could be invested in useful infrastructure projects, such as the development of the Rhine valley rail route, and will prevent them from being implemented for decades.

6) "S21 is irreversible – the contracts are binding and the cost of withdrawing from them now would be much too high"

In fact: The Land of Baden-Württemberg can withdraw from the S21 contracts without any difficulty at all now that it has emerged that the funding of S21 is unconstitutional. And in any case, the exit costs are nowhere near as high as the project's backers claim. During the fact check session on 12 November 2010 Deutsche Bahn board member Dr Kefer admitted that the exit costs amount to 600 million euros at most. And as the funding structure of S21 is unconstitutional these exit costs would have to be covered not by the Land of Baden-Württemberg, but by Deutsche Bahn/the Federal Government.

7) "S21 will create 10,000 long-term jobs"

In fact: Although large shopping centres and new offices for insurance companies and banks will be built on the land currently occupied by the railway tracks, this does not mean that new jobs will be created as well. When a new shopping centre opens, for example, it does not mean that people automatically start buying more. All that is likely to happen is that jobs will shift from the existing shopping districts (especially the Königstrasse) to the new centres. So where are the 10,000 new jobs supposed to come from?

There are no "good reasons" for building S21. If S21 is stopped Baden-Württemberg will not be disconnected from anything. S21 is being pushed through so vehemently because of the large sums of money which are at stake for Deutsche Bahn (and because of the bonuses which DB managers, among others, stand to receive). If S21 is abandoned, Deutsche Bahn is contractually obliged to unwind the 2001 sale of DB land to the city of Stuttgart. The plot of land occupied by the approach tracks to the aboveground station would return to DB who would have to repay some 740 million euros to Stuttgart. However, DB already booked the proceeds of the sale as profit in its 2009 accounts and would therefore find itself in an extremely awkward situation. In contrast to S21, which is set to cost at least 5.3 billion euros*, modernisation of the existing aboveground station can be carried out for a third of this amount and be implemented in phases. And unlike Stuttgart 21, the K21 modernisation project does not involve major disruption to road traffic in the Stuttgart area for the next 10-15 years.

More information is available at www.kopfbahnhof-21.de , www.infooffensive.de

* According to the Federal Audit Office: 5.3 billion euros. Rail consultants Vieregg & Rössler estimate the cost to be as high as 6.9 billion euros