

Stuttgart 21 concerns us all!

Why K21 is better than S21 PLUS

Heiner Geissler's „Fact Check“ exposed serious shortcomings in Stuttgart 21 and led him to call for costly improvements (which he dubbed „Stuttgart 21 Plus“). Even if these changes could be implemented, they would still not be able to overcome the fundamental risks and disadvantages of the planned underground station.

A modernised aboveground station (Kopfbahnhof 21 - K21) at the heart of an efficient rail system in Stuttgart remains the better alternative.

Efficient rail services:

- A modernised aboveground station is able to meet all future requirements; there is no need for a new station.
- An integrated regular-service timetable with optimised connections is possible with the 16-platform aboveground station but not with the underground S21 PLUS station with just 8 or 10 platforms.
- K21 can be implemented gradually, as required, whereas there is no scope for any extension of S21 PLUS.
- The aboveground station can be used by S-Bahn trains when the S-Bahn tunnel is out of action.

Safety and barrier-free accessibility:

- The aboveground station has level, barrier-free escape routes which allow wheelchair users to reach safety unassisted.
- The platforms in the aboveground station do not slope (unlike those of S21 PLUS whose 1.5 % incline is six times the regular authorised gradient!) and therefore present fewer risks for passengers (wheelchairs, baby carriages, wheeled suitcases will stay put) and trains (no risk of them rolling inadvertently if the brakes are not applied).
- In the event of fire, it is possible to escape from the aboveground station faster and more easily - towards the approach tracks, if necessary - than from the underground station.
- The vehicles of the emergency services can reach the scene of an accident in the aboveground station more easily.

Comfort and quality of life:

- The unused luggage platforms in the aboveground station can be raised and used as exit platforms, thus allowing simultaneous boarding and alighting.
- Level access to the platforms is retained in the aboveground station.
- Aboveground arrival in the city and the station instead of travelling through tunnels under the city. (With S21 PLUS trains enter the tunnel at Feuerbach and do not emerge into daylight again until the train reaches the Filder plain).
- The aboveground station conveys the emotional value of arriving and departing instead of merely „rushing through“, as is the case with S21 PLUS.



Stuttgart 21

© Aldinger und Wolf, Planungsstand 2007



K21 ja zum Kopfbahnhof
Bahnhof mit Vernunft.

© Prof. Roland Ostertag, Visualisierung Pro eleven

Conservation of nature and historic monuments:

- The middle „Schlossgarten“ fully retains its function as a recreational area in the city centre.
- The large, ancient trees which perform a number of important functions in the Schlossgarten are neither felled nor transplanted (unsuccessfully). They continue to contribute to improving the city climate by serving as fine particulate filters and as sources of oxygen and shade.
- K21 does not require the groundwater level to be lowered and there is therefore no risk that other trees, such as the avenue of plane trees on the path to the Rosensteinmuseum, will wither and die.
- As no trees have to be felled, there is no threat to protected species, such as the eremite beetle [Juchtenkäfer] or bats.
- With K21 the approach tracks are retained, and with them the important ballasted areas which provide a habitat for animals and plants.
- No further destruction of the Paul Bonatz-designed station building which is, in any case, a listed architectural monument.

Geological risks:

- No risk of gypsum keuper swelling as a result of tunnelling operations.
- No threat to Europe's second largest mineral water springs, as K21 does not require the construction of a vast concrete trough (for the underground station) at right angles to the groundwater flows.

Urban development:

- K21 does not ruin the cityscape with an 8-metre high embankment which cuts through the city centre from north to south.
- Vacant land can be used immediately instead of in ten years' time - or even longer.
- Centres of cultural activity, such as the „Röhre“ and „Rocker 33“ (music venues) as well as historic buildings such as the „Reichsbahndirektion“ (former head office of the railway authority in Stuttgart) are retained.

Disruption during construction of S21 (set to last at least 10 years):

- With K21 there is no need to transport tunnel spoil by truck through the centre of the city. This aspect of S21 PLUS would have a serious impact through fine particulate emissions, noise and traffic congestion.
- Road traffic will not be disrupted during construction of K21, whereas S21 PLUS would give rise to hold-ups - on the Heilbronner Strasse, for example.
- As K21 does not involve any groundwater management operations (lowering the level of the groundwater to allow construction work to take place), there is no need for a 17-kilometre surface network of unsightly pipes to be installed in the city and Schlossgarten.

Costs and energy consumption:

- Modernisation of the aboveground station is still significantly less costly than building S21 PLUS, even when the costs associated with abandoning the S21 project are included.
- The energy and maintenance costs for the aboveground station are far lower as fewer escalators and lifts are required and it is possible to dispense with artificial lighting and ventilation to a large extent.

To sum up:

K21 is better able to deliver the required rail services than S21 PLUS

K21 is more ecological and cost-effective

K21 has none of the disadvantages or risks which are still present in S21 PLUS

K 21 = HIGHER performance

LOWER costs and LOWER risks

You can support our campaign by making a donation for the „Aktionsbündnis gegen Stuttgart 21“ [Alliance against Stuttgart 21] to BUND Regionalverband Stuttgart, Südwestbank AG, KTO [A/C] 618 052 020, BLZ [sort code] 600 907 00